Unacknowledged sources in publications by Carla Rossi

Based on research by Peter Burger (Nieuwscheckers.nl / Leiden University, The Netherlands) and on pointers in Twitter messages regarding #Receptiogate. Updated until January 4, 2023.

1 Intersexuality in pictures

Intersexuality in pictures: hermaphrodites and gender fluidity in medieval illuminated manuscripts. Three-year project, conceived by Prof. Carla Rossi, and funded for three years by the Baugarten Stiftung, the Stiftung für wissenschaftliche Forschung an der Universität Zürich, and the Società Filologica Internazionale RECEPTIO. Available at:

https://www.receptio.eu/genderfluidityinthemiddleages.

Archived version:

https://web.archive.org/web/20221225114046/https://www.receptio.eu/genderfluidityinthemiddleages

The project description contains unacknowledged borrowings from the following sources (most of the similarities were pointed out on Twitter by Yael Rice: https://twitter.com/Yael Rice/status/1607859617316634624):

- DeVun, L. (2008). The Jesus hermaphrodite: science and sex difference in premodern Europe. *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 69(2), 193-218. Available at: https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/30134036.pdf
- Kukla, E. & Zellman, R. (2007). Created by the Hand of Heaven: A Jewish Approach to Intersexuality (Parashat Tazria and Parashat Metzora). Keshet, 21 April. Available at: https://www.keshetonline.org/resources/created-by-the-hand-of-heaven-a-jewish-approach-to-intersexuality-parashat-tazria-and-parashat-metzora/
- Van der Lugt, M. (2010). Sex Difference in Medieval Theology and Canon Law. A
 Tribute to Joan Cadden. Medieval feminist forum, 46(1), 101-121. Available at:
 https://shs.hal.science/file/index/docid/546551/filename/tribute_cadden_sex_difference.pdf
- Nederman, C. J., & True, J. (1996). The Third Sex: the idea of the hermaphrodite in Twelfth-Century Europe. *Journal of the History of Sexuality*, 6(4), 497-517.
- Rolker, C. (2015). 'All humans are male, female, or hermaphrodite': ambiguously sexed bodies in late-medieval Europe. *Hypotheses*, 11 September. https://mittelalter.hypotheses.org/6596
- Sexon, S. (2017). Queering Christ's Wounds and Gender Fluidity in Medieval Manuscripts. History Matters, 8 August. http://www.historymatters.group.shef.ac.uk/queering-christs-wounds-gender-fluidity-medieval-manuscripts/

Rossi, 2.3.4	DeVun 2008
By the turn of the fourteenth century,	By the turn of the fourteenth century,
Latin alchemy was in the process of	Latin alchemy was in the process of

changing from a self-consciously scholastic discipline, wedded to the language of Aristotelian natural philosophy, to a field of study that was increasingly religious in its sentiments and vocabulary. The image of the hermaphrodite became crucial to these new writings, as can be seen from the text and manuscript illuminations of the undated Aurora consurgens and the early fifteenth-century Buch der Heiligen Dreifaltigkeit (Book of the Holy Trinity).

changing from a self-consciously scholastic discipline, wedded to the language of Aristotelian natural philosophy, to a field of study that was increasingly religious in its sentiments and vocabulary. The image of the hermaphrodite became crucial to these new writings, as can be seen from the text and manuscript illuminations of the undated *Aurora consurgens* and the early fifteenth-century *Book of the Holy Trinity*.

Rossi, footnote #1

אַנִדְּרוֹגְינוֹס in Hebrew means "intersex" and refers to someone who possesses both male and female sexual characteristics. The Mishnah explains: «The androgynos in some ways is like men, and in some ways is like women, and in some ways is like both men and women, and in some ways is like neither men nor women» (Bikkurim 4: 1). In the Mishnah, Rabbi Yosi makes the radical statement: «androgynos bria bifnei atzma hu / the androgynos he is a created being of her own». This Hebrew phrase blends male and female pronouns to poetically express the complexity of the androgynos' identity.

Kukla & Zellman 2007

The Mishnah (<u>Bikkurim 4: 1</u>) explains: "The *androgynos* in some ways is like men, and in some ways is like women, and in some ways is like both men and women, and in some ways is like neither men nor women."

[...]

In the Mishnah, Rabbi Yosi makes the radical statement: "androgynos bria bifnei atzma hu / the androgynos he is a created being of her own." This Hebrew phrase blends male and female pronouns to poetically express the complexity of the androgynos' identity.

Rossi, 2.1

[...] it should be borne in mind that our clear divisions between Church, secular society and medicine, understood today as different intellectual frameworks, may not always do full justice to the cross-disciplinary nature of the reflections on sexuality in the Middle Ages.

In the medieval debate about sex differences, the Church cannot be understood only as an institution that defined and enforced a sexual code. As recent research by Peter Biller, Caroline Bynum, Alain Boureau, Joseph Ziegler, and others has brought to light, medieval theologians and canonists also

Van der Lugt, p. 102

The distinctions between "science," "the Church," and "lay society," understood as "different intellectual frameworks," [...] may not always do full justice to the cross-disciplinary nature of scholastic thought itself. In the medieval debate about sex difference, the Church cannot be understood only as a source of values and norms, as an institution that defined and enforced a sexual code. Medieval theologians and canonists also participated actively in contemporary learned discussions about the natural body. [...] However, they did so also—as recent research by

participated actively in learned discussions about the natural body.	Caroline Bynum, Peter Biller, Alain Boureau, Joseph Ziegler, and others has brought to light—in strictly theological works.
Rossi, footnote #3 Joan Cadden is one of the first historians who reflected and invited reflection on the natural characteristics of men and women and on the construction of gender to medieval debates about physiology, procreation, intercourse, and plansure.	Van der Lugt 2010, p. 101 Joan Cadden is one of the first historians who applied the question of the natural characteristics of men and women and the construction of gender to medieval debates about physiology, procreation, intercourse, and pleasure.
intercourse, and pleasure. Rossi, 2.3.3 A noted polymath, Alan wrote during the 1160s or possibly 1170s a work entitled De planctu naturae (The Complaint of Nature), which examines the relation between grammar and gender.	Nederman & True 1996, p. 508 A noted polymath, Alan wrote during the 1160s or possibly 1170s a work entitled De planctu naturae (The Complaint of Nature), which examines the relation between grammar and gender.
Rossi, 2.3.1 Hermaphrodites could marry, inherit, act as witness, enter holy orders etc. according to the gender assigned to them. The legal status of 'predominantly male' hermaphrodites was clearly better than that of women and with only few qualifications	Rolker 2015 Hence, hermaphrodites could marry, inherit, act as witness, enter holy orders etc. according to the gender assigned to them. The legal status of 'predominantly male' hermaphrodites was clearly better than that of women and with only few qualifications
equalled that of men; unlike women, for example, they could be ordained, but unlike men, dispensation was needed for such an ordination. Lawyers discussed various criteria (body and behaviour) as indicating the 'prevailing' sex; following Hostiensis, both laws	equalled that of men; unlike women, for example, they could be ordained, but unlike men, dispensation was needed for such an ordination. Lawyers discussed various criteria (body and behaviour) as indicating the 'prevailing' sex; following Hostiensis, both laws
finally adopted the solution that in doubtful cases, the 'perfect' hermaphrodite should swear an oath which gender s/he belonged to. This at least in theory left some choice to the individual; in practice, much depended on the social environment.	finally adopted the solution that in doubtful cases, the 'perfect' hermaphrodite should swear an oath which gender s/he belonged to. This at least in theory left some choice to the individual; in practice, much depended on the social environment.
Rossi, 2.1 and 2.3.3 Starting from Christ's isolated side wound in Books of Hours [6], it is arguable that these images destabilise Christ's gender by drawing the focus on	Sexon 2017 Comparing these images to the shape of Christ's isolated side wound in Books of Hours, it is arguable that these images destabilise Christ's gender by drawing

Christ's body to a prominent bleeding vulva. [2.1]
Analysing Christ's isolated side wound

in Books of Hours, it is arguable that these images destabilise Christ's gender by drawing the focus on Christ's body to a prominent bleeding vulva. [2.3.3] the focus on Christ's body to a prominent bleeding vulva.

2 A proposal for the interpretation of the inscription on the British Museum sword (Rossi 2015)

A proposal for the interpretation of the inscription on the British Museum sword. Available at :

https://www.academia.edu/14828685/A proposal for the interpretation of the inscripti on on the British Museum sword

Contains unsourced text from Paul M. Remfry (2009). *Welsh Princes and English Politics*. Available at: http://www.castlewales.com/lincoln.html (or from other, similar publications by Remfry, available at

https://www.britainexpress.com/wales/history/battle-lincoln.htm and http://www.castles99.ukprint.com/Essays/lincolnbattle.html)

Rossi

Around 6 January 1141 King Stephen went with a small army to try to capture the earl of Chester at Lincoln. However he proved too slow and the earl left his brother William Roumare to defend the fortress while he slipped away to the south to join Earl Robert of Gloucester and Miles Gloucester in the Marches of Wales.

Together these men formed a large army which consisted of a full one third Welshmen and united they marched against the king at Lincoln. The Chronicler monk Ordericus Vitalis recorded the resultant battle and stated that the Welsh contingent was led by two princely brothers, Mariadoth et Kaladrius. The first of these two men was certainly Maredudd and the second may have been a heavily mutated Cadwgan. Both are likely to have been sons of Madog ab Idnerth of Maelienydd (Radnorshire) and enemies

Remfry

Early in 1141 King Stephen went to Lincoln to try to recover that castle from the earl of Chester. The earl left his brother William Roumare to defend the fortress and slipped away to the south to join Earl Robert of Gloucester and Miles Gloucester in the Marches of Wales. Together these men formed a large army which consisted of a full one third Welshmen and united they marched against the king at Lincoln. The now ancient Ordericus Vitalis, the Chronicler monk born in Shropshire, recorded the resultant battle and stated that the Welsh contingent was led by two princes and brothers, Mariadoth et Kaladrius. The first of these two men was certainly Maredudd and the second may have been a heavily mutated Cadwgan. Both are likely to have been sons of Madog ab Idnerth of Maelienydd and enemies of Hugh Mortimer of Wigmore, the arch royalist

of Hugh Mortimer of Wigmore, the arch royalist in the west.

It has previously been held that these two men were Madog ap Maredudd of Powys and his brother in law, Cadwaladr of Gwynedd, both of whom were in contact with the earl of Chester. However, today the identification would seem to rest with Maredudd and Cadwgan, men who had more to gain from service to the Angevin cause.

in the west. It has previously been held that these two men were Madog ap Maredudd of Powys and his brother in law, Cadwaladr of Gwynedd, both of whom were in contact with the earl of Chester. However, on etymological grounds the identification would seem to rest with Maredudd and Cadwgan, men who had more to gain from service to the Angevin cause.

3 Importante ritrovamento a Lugano: un Crocifisso ligneo riemerge dai depositi del Museo Storico

Rossi, C. (2020). Importante ritrovamento a Lugano: un Crocifisso ligneo riemerge dai depositi del Museo Storico. *About Art Online*, 21 June.

https://www.aboutartonline.com/importante-ritrovamento-a-lugano-un-crocifisso-ligneo-riemerge-dai-depositi-nel-museo-storico/

Contains unacknowledged material from publications by Maria Concetta Di Natale:

- Di Natale, M. C. (2008). Le croci dipinte in Sicilia: Dalla devozione alla musealizzazione. Römisches Jahrbuch der Bibliotheca Hertziana, 38, 173-204. Available at:
 - https://iris.unipa.it/retrieve/handle/10447/52541/334595/dinatale hertziana.pdf
- Di Natale, M.C. (2013). Il Crocifisso nelle Chiese francescane in Sicilia: dalla croce dipinta tardo-gotica alle sculture in legno e in mistura della Maniera. In M.D. Di Natale (ed.), Opere d'arte nelle chiese francescane Conservazione, restauro e musealizzazione. Quaderni dell'Osservatorio per le Arti Decorative in Italia "Maria Accàscina" 4 (pp. 22-47). Palermo: Edizioni Plumelia. Available at: https://iris.unipa.it/bitstream/10447/96153/2/francescani_dinatale.pdf

Rossi 2020

Considerazioni iconografiche generali: nei crocifissi lignei processionali coevi, la funzione di risvegliare la compassione del fedele è affidata alla figura principale del Christus Patiens (qui staccatasi dalla croce), affiancata da due personaggi che fungono da intermediari dello sforzo empatico: Maria e Giovanni, ad offrire nel loro colloquio con il moribondo e nel loro pianto per la sua morte, un modello di comportamento per i fedeli. In alcuni crocifissi (di produzione pisana), la Madonna ha sul manto la stella, che la

Di Natale 2013 & 2008

[MCDN 2013, p. 22]'[...] Nella tavola dipinta la funzione di risvegliare la compassione del fedele è affidata solamente alla figura principale, affiancata da due figure che fungono da intermediari dello sforzo empatico. Non è un caso che siano Maria e Giovanni ad offrire nel loro colloquio con il moribondo e nel loro pianto per la sua morte un modello di comportamento"4.'

[MCDN 2008, p. 185] Ai lati sono la Madonna, che porta sul manto la stella, solitamente presente nelle immagini della distingue come Stella maris, nell'atto di indicare il Figlio con la mano destra, mentre ripiega sotto il mento la sinistra, secondo uno schema iconografico di ispirazione bizantina.

Vergine di importazione pisana, che la distinguono come *Stella maris*, nell'atto di indicare il Figlio con la mano destra, mentre ripiega sotto il mento la sinistra, secondo lo schema iconografico di ricordo bizantino [...].

Rossi

Generalmente la figura di Cristo, che si rifà ai moduli del gotico doloroso, è umanizzata, contorta, sofferente, ma con i segni di un martirio che viene ancora sopportato passivamente, poiché simboleggia l'atto della redenzione e il suo ripetersi nel sacrificio eucaristico e sottolinea la sofferenza di Gesù-Uomo, che invita alla compassione, al sentimento di pietà, mettendo il fedele in uno stato d'animo che viene definito devotio.

Di Natale 2013, p. 25

La figura di Cristo, che si rifà ai moduli del gotico doloroso, è umanizzata, contorta, sofferente, ma con i segni di un martirio che viene ancora sopportato passivamente. A proposito del "concetto di pietas", Belting nota che "indica da una parte il sacrificio del Messia che simboleggia l'atto della redenzione e il suo ripetersi nel sacrificio eucaristico, dall'altra sottolinea la sofferenza di Gesù-Uomo, che invita alla compassione, al sentimento della pietà, mettendo il fedele in uno stato d'animo che viene definito devotio"30.

Rossi

In alcune croci astili coeve, il Creatore è posto sopra ad un pellicano, simbolo cristologico, sito in cima all'albero della conoscenza del bene e del male, insidiato dal serpente, e in basso vi è il teschio di Adamo, in riferimento alla Legenda aura di Jacopo da Varagine, secondo cui Cristo fu crocifisso là dove era stato sepolto Adamo, cosicché il suo sangue, anche visivamente, potesse lavare il progenitore e l'umanità tutta dal peccato originale.

Di Natale 2013, p. 23

Nei capicroce ai lati del Crocifisso sono la Madonna e San Giovanni, in alto il Redentore benedicente, solitamente sopra il pellicano, simbolo cristologico, sito in cima all'albero della conoscenza del bene e del male, insidiato dal serpente, e in basso il teschio di Adamo, in riferimento alla Legenda aura di Jacopo da Varagine16, secondo cui Cristo fu crocifisso là dove era stato sepolto Adamo, cosicché il suo sangue, anche visivamente, potesse lavare il progenitore e l'umanità tutta dal peccato originale, e sotto cui talora si trova la figura della Maddalena, la peccatrice pentita17.

4 De Ponthieu Hours

Rossi, C. (2022). De Ponthieu Hours. *Theory and Criticism of Literature and Arts (TCLA)*, 6(1), 62-71. Available at:

https://www.receptioacademic.press/ files/ugd/494184 30bbbec039ac4d0fa3dd6b8527f0 4346.pdf

Contains unacknowledged borrowing from

• https://www.textmanuscripts.com/medieval/germain-hardouyn-printed-book-of-hours-141447

Rossi, p. 67

Although Pichore was mainly an illuminator, he was also an entrepreneur among the first French *imprimeurs*, setting up a press with Remi de Laistre in 1503. He designed numerous metalcuts for himself and others, publishing a first series under his own name in 1504. By 1508, he was supplying designs for Books of Hours by other printers, especially Simon Vostre, Thielman Kerver, Guillaume Eustace and the brothers Gillet and Germain Hardouin.

Textmanuscripts.com

Although Pichore was mainly an illuminator, he was also an entrepreneur at the head of a large and productive workshop in Paris, where the designs for the present metalcuts were elaborated. Pichore tried his hand at printing, setting up a press with Remi de Laistre in 1503. He designed numerous metalcuts for himself and others, publishing a first series under his own name in 1504. By 1508, he was supplying designs for Books of Hours by other printers, especially Simon Vostre, Thielman Kerver, Guillaume Eustace and the brothers Gillet and Germain Hardouin.

5 Forgery, Fraud, and Mystification

Forgery, Fraud, and Mystification (2019-2025). Available at: https://www.receptio.eu/files/ugd/494184 a1cd9946439f4b508f7532597b297bda.pdf
This (unpaged) document also contains Rossi's text NETLOGY: FILOLOGIA APPLICATA AL LINGUAGGIO DELLA RETE. Definizione del metodo.

This project description contains unacknowledged borrowings from publications by Levi Roach and Claudio Lagomarsini:

- Lagomarsini, C. (2017). I filologi e le "fake news". *Il Post*, 4 January. Available at: https://www.ilpost.it/2017/01/04/post-verita-filologia/
- Roach, L. (2021). The forged texts of the Middle Ages: why Europe's holy men turned to counterfeiting. History Extra. The official website for BBC History Magazine and BBC History Revealed, 4 February.

https://www.historyextra.com/period/medieval/the-forged-texts-of-the-middle-ages-why-europes-holy-men-turned-to-counterfeiting.

Rossi, 1st paragraph

As known, during the Middle Ages, forgeries not only were significant parts of archives and other resources for the writing of history, but they also were often the products of historical research on the part of their authors. We can state that forgery was rife in the medieval era, with some of

Roach, 1st paragraph

Forgery was rife in the medieval era, with some of Europe's leading holy men cooking up reams of counterfeit documents. Levi Roach examines the fabricated texts of one Bavarian bishop to pick apart why the practice was so popular

Europe's leading holy men cooking up	
reams of counterfeit documents.	
Rossi, NETLOGY, I: PER UNA	Lagomarsini, 3rd paragraph
(RI)DEFINIZIONE DEL METODO FILOLOGICO	
E DELLE SUE APPLICAZIONI	
Purtroppo, nel momento stesso in cui	Quando Roland Barthes celebra la «morte
Roland Barthes celebrò la «morte	dell'autore» (1967), di fatto mette in
dell'autore» (1967), mise di fatto in	discussione il senso stesso della filologia,
discussione il senso stesso della filologia,	intesa come disciplina che si dà come
come disciplina il cui fine ultimo è	ultimo scopo l'accertamento del testo
l'individuazione del testo originale, ossia di	originale, cioè di una forma del testo il più
una forma del testo il più possibile vicina	possibile «vicina all'ultima volontà
all'ultima volontà dell'autore.	dell'autore» (come recitano i manuali
	universitari).

6 Descriptions of the Receptio institute

Several sentences describing the Receptio institute appear to have been borrowed from websites of other institutes.

https://www.receptio.eu	www.ici-berlin.org/institute/
Our centre defines itself through a series of	It defines itself through a series of
interlocking core projects that are designed	interlocking <u>core projects</u> that are designed
to traverse different disciplines and foster	to traverse different disciplines and foster
theoretical and critical interventions of	theoretical and critical interventions of
cultural inquiry.	cultural inquiry.
www.receptio.eu/researchersinresidence	itatti.harvard.edu/i-tatti-fellowship
RECEPTIO offers: the precious time and	I Tatti offers Fellows the precious time they
location they need to pursue their studies	need to pursue their studies with a
with a minimum of obligations and	minimum of obligations and interruptions
interruptions together with a maximum of	together with a maximum of scholarly
scholarly resources, a combination that	resources—a combination that
distinguishes our Center from similar	distinguishes the Harvard Center from
institutions.	similar institutions.
https://www.receptio.eu/programmes	https://www.graduateinstitute.ch/study
The Institute's diverse research areas and	The Institute's diverse faculty and student
student body form an innovative,	body form an innovative, cosmopolitan and
cosmopolitan and enriching academic	enriching academic environment, providing
environment, providing students with the	you with the skills and networks needed to
skills and networks needed to pursue an	pursue an exciting career.
exciting career.	